

IN THE DISTRICT COURT OF THE FIFTH JUDICIAL DISTRICT OF THE  
STATE OF IDAHO, IN AND FOR THE COUNTY OF TWIN FALLS

**AMENDED**

2005 MAY -9 AM 1:33

In Re SRBA )  
 )  
Case No. 39576 )  
\_\_\_\_\_ )

PARTIAL DECREE PURSUANT TO  
I.R.C.P. 54(b) FOR

Water Right 24-10237

DISTRICT COURT-SRBA  
TWIN FALLS CO., IDAHO  
FILED *[Signature]*

NAME AND ADDRESS: USDI BLM  
IDAHO STATE OFFICE  
1387 S VINNELL WAY  
BOISE, ID 83709-1657

SOURCE: SPRING TRIBUTARY: HORSE CREEK

QUANTITY: 0.02 CFS

THE QUANTITY OF WATER UNDER THIS RIGHT SHALL NOT EXCEED 13,000  
GALLONS PER DAY.

PRIORITY DATE: 04/17/1926

THIS WATER RIGHT IS CLAIMED BASED ON FEDERAL LAW WITH AN  
APRIL 17, 1926, DATE OF PRIORITY PURSUANT TO AN EXECUTIVE ORDER  
SIGNED THE SAME DATE AND KNOWN AS PUBLIC WATER RESERVE 107.

POINT OF DIVERSION: T07S R46E S21 NESWSW Within Caribou County

| PURPOSE AND<br>PERIOD OF USE: | PURPOSE OF USE | PERIOD OF USE  | QUANTITY |
|-------------------------------|----------------|----------------|----------|
|                               | Stockwater     | 01-01 TO 12-31 | 0.02 CFS |

PLACE OF USE: Stockwater Within Caribou County  
T07S R46E S21 SWSW

OTHER PROVISIONS NECESSARY FOR DEFINITION OR ADMINISTRATION OF THIS WATER RIGHT:

THE QUANTITY OF WATER DECREED FOR THIS WATER RIGHT IS NOT A  
DETERMINATION OF HISTORICAL BENEFICIAL USE.

THIS PARTIAL DECREE IS SUBJECT TO SUCH GENERAL PROVISIONS  
NECESSARY FOR THE DEFINITION OF THE RIGHTS OR FOR THE EFFICIENT  
ADMINISTRATION OF THE WATER RIGHTS AS MAY BE ULTIMATELY  
DETERMINED BY THE COURT AT A POINT IN TIME NO LATER THAN THE  
ENTRY OF A FINAL UNIFIED DECREE. I.C. SECTION 42-1412(6).

RULE 54(b) CERTIFICATE

With respect to the issues determined by the above judgment or order, it is hereby CERTIFIED, in accordance with Rule 54(b), I.R.C.P., that the court has determined that there is no just reason for delay of the entry of a final judgment and that the court has and does hereby direct that the above judgment or order shall be a final judgment upon which execution may issue and an appeal may be taken as provided by the Idaho Appellate Rules.

*[Signature]*  
John M. Melanson  
Presiding Judge of the  
Snake River Basin Adjudication



IN THE DISTRICT COURT OF THE FIFTH JUDICIAL DISTRICT OF THE  
STATE OF IDAHO, IN AND FOR THE COUNTY OF TWIN FALLS

In Re SRBA

Case No. 39576

)  
)  
) **ORDER GRANTING MOTION TO SET**  
) **ASIDE PARTIAL DECREE,**  
) **and**  
) **ORDER OF AMENDED PARTIAL**  
) **DECREE: I.R.C.P. 60(b)**  
)

For water rights: 22-12906 *et al.* See  
attached list.

***Order Setting Aside Partial Decrees***

***Partial Decrees*** were issued for the attached water rights between June 1, 2004 and June 30, 2004. The ***Partial Decrees*** were issued in accordance with five ***Special Master's Reports and Recommendations*** issued by Special Master Thomas R. Cushman. The Claimant of the water rights, the United States of America, acting through the Bureau of Land Management (United States), filed a ***Motion to Set Aside and Reissue Partial Decrees*** on December 29, 2004. A hearing was held on the ***Motion*** on April 21, 2005, in Blackfoot, Idaho. Mr. Lee Leininger appeared for the United States. There was no opposition to the ***Motion***.

The rights were originally claimed by the United States as "dual-based" rights, meaning the rights were claimed as state-based beneficial-use water rights and as federal-reserved water rights pursuant to Public Water Reserve (PWR) 107. After initial objections to the rights were resolved, all of the above rights were heard by the Special Master at hearings pursuant to Idaho Code 42-1411A(12). The United States submitted affidavits in conjunction with those hearings. The affidavits are sufficient to show that the United States has met its burden under I.C. 42-1411A(12) of the existence of a federal-

reserved water right for the above rights. However, Special Master Cushman held that, as a matter of law, the United States was not entitled to PWR 107 water rights due to the existence of a pending homestead application on the subject properties underlying the water rights on April 17, 1926, the date of enactment of PWR 107. Those rulings were made in accordance with Special Master Cushman's ruling in Consolidated Subcases 25-13635 *et al*, in which the Special Master ruled that a pending homestead application defeated reservation under PWR 107, even though the homestead entry was never perfected. That ruling by the Special Master was subsequently reviewed by this Court on Challenge. In the *Memorandum Decision and Order on Challenge; Order of Partial Decrees, subcases 25-13635 et al* (October 4, 2004), this Court held that the Special Master erred as a matter of law in ruling that a pending homestead entry defeated reservation under PWR 107. Instead, the Court reversed the Special Master, and ruled that once a homestead entry failed, the federal withdrawal of the land attached and no subsequent withdrawal was required. The water rights in Subcases 25-12635 were decreed with April 17, 1926, priority dates.

The United States moved this Court to set aside the *Partial Decrees* in the above subcases pursuant to I.R.C.P. 60(b)(5), which allows the Court to relieve a party from a final judgment if a prior judgment upon which it is based has been reversed or otherwise vacated. It is apparent to this Court that the legal grounds for the *Special Master's Reports* and subsequent *Partial Decrees* were identical to the legal conclusions that were reversed by this Court in its *Memorandum Decision and Order on Challenge; Order of Partial Decrees, subcases 25-13635 et al*. Therefore, because this Court reversed the judgment of the Special Master in subcases 25-13635 *et al*, which contained the legal precedent for the above-captioned subcases, the Court finds it appropriate to set aside the *Partial Decrees* in the above-captioned subcases.

This ruling, pursuant to I.R.C.P. 60(b), is limited to the facts and circumstances of these subcases.

#### **Order Amending Partial Decrees.**

Special Master Cushman held hearings in accordance with I.C. 42-1411A(12) in the above-captioned subcases. Therefore, the Court finds that the requirements of I.C. 42-

1411A(12) have been met, and that no further evidentiary hearing is necessary. Affidavits were submitted by the United States as follows:

1) For water rights 22-12906 and 22-12960, the *Affidavit of Fredric W. Price in Subcases 22-12906 et al*, was filed on November 18, 2003.

2) For water rights 24-10235, 24-10237, 24-10259, 24-10261, 24-12065, 24-10279, 24-10351, 24-10357, 24-10541, 24-10542, 24-10544; the *Affidavit of Fredric W. Price in Subcases 24-10235 et al*, was filed on November 17, 2003.

3) For water rights 55-10460, 55-10462, 55-10464, 55-10719, 55-10721, 55-11735, 55-11886, 55-12133, 55-12287, 55-12560, 55-12568, 55-12570, 55-12576, 55-12629, 55-12707, 55-12713, 55-12821, 61-10949, 61-11010, 61-11012, 61-11312, 61-11425, 61-11479, 61-11533, 65-19742, 65-19746, 65-20017, 65-20019, 65-20021, 65-20023, 65-20025, 65-20027, 65-20029, 65-20031, 65-20065, 65-20067, 65-20119; the *Affidavit of Robert R. Mallis in Subcases 51-10499 et al* was filed on July 31, 2003.

4) For Water Right 61-10953, the *Affidavit of Robert R. Mallis in Subcases 51-10398 et al* was filed on February 12, 2004.

5) For Water Right 29-13042, the *Affidavit of Fredric W. Price in Subcases 29-12626 et al* was filed on November 18, 2003.

After reviewing the affidavits, the Court finds that the United States has met its burden in proving a federal reserved water right pursuant to P.W.R. 107.

Based upon the file and record in these subcases, and the affidavits, the Court makes the following findings of fact and conclusions of law:

1. Prior to April 17, 1926, no water rights had been established pursuant to state law for the use of the water from the subject water source for each claim.

3. On April 17, 1926, President Coolidge executed Public Water Reserve 107, which withdrew the 40 acre tract of land upon which the subject water source for the claims is located from the public domain. The tract of land withdrawn for each claim is described as the "place of use" element on the attached *Partial Decrees*.

4. The subject water sources for the claims consist of a spring or water hole of the type contemplated by Public Water Reserve 107.

5. Contemporaneously with the withdrawal of the land, President Coolidge impliedly reserved enough water to fulfill the primary purpose of the land reservation for each claim.

6. The minimum amount of water necessary to fulfill the primary purpose of the land reservation is the amount set forth in the "quantity" element on the attached *Partial Decree* for each claim.

7. The United States has satisfied its burden under Idaho Code section 42-1411A(12) as to the nature and existence of the claimed federal reserve water right for each claim.

8. The elements of the federal reserved water right for each claim are set forth on the attached *Partial Decrees*.

Therefore, IT IS ORDERED, that the *Partial Decrees* for the above water rights are set aside, and are hereby amended and decreed as set forth in the attached *Amended Partial Decrees Pursuant to I.R.C.P. 60(b)*.

Dated: ~~April~~ <sup>May</sup> 6<sup>th</sup> 2005.

  
JOHN M. MELANSON  
Presiding Judge  
Snake River Basin Adjudication

EXHIBIT A 22-12906, ET AL.

Subcase Nos:

22-12906 65-20067  
22-12920 65-20119  
24-10235  
24-10237  
24-10259  
24-10261  
24-10265  
24-10279  
24-10351  
24-10357  
24-10541  
24-10542  
24-10544  
29-13042  
55-10460  
55-10462  
55-10464  
55-10719  
55-10721  
55-11735  
55-11886  
55-12133  
55-12287  
55-12560  
55-12568  
55-12570  
55-12576  
55-12629  
55-12707  
55-12713  
55-12821  
61-10949  
61-10953  
61-11010  
61-11012  
61-11312  
61-11425  
61-11479  
61-11533  
65-19742  
65-19746  
65-20017  
65-20019  
65-20021  
65-20023  
65-20025  
65-20027  
65-20029  
65-20031  
65-20065

(Subcase list: 22-12906JM)  
5/09/05

CERTIFICATE OF MAILING

I certify that a true and correct copy of the ORDER GRANTING MOTION TO SET ASIDE PARTIAL DECREE, AND ORDER OF AMENDED PARTIAL DECREE: I.R.C.P. 60(B) was mailed on May 09, 2005, with sufficient first-class postage to the following:

STATE OF IDAHO

Represented by:  
NATURAL RESOURCES DIV CHIEF  
STATE OF IDAHO  
ATTORNEY GENERAL'S OFFICE  
PO BOX 44449  
BOISE, ID 83711-4449

USDI BLM

Represented by:  
US DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE  
ENVIRONMENT & NATL' RESOURCES  
550 WEST FORT STREET, MSC 033  
BOISE, ID 83724

DIRECTOR OF IDWR

PO BOX 83720  
BOISE, ID 83720-0098

A handwritten signature in cursive script, reading "Julie Murphy", is written over a horizontal line. The signature is in dark ink and is positioned to the right of the printed text "Deputy Clerk".