

RECEIVED

JAN 04 2008

DEPARTMENT OF
WATER RESOURCES

a

DISTRICT COURT - SRBA Fifth Judicial District County of Twin Falls - State of Idaho	
JAN 3 2008	
By <u>[Signature]</u>	Clerk
	Deputy Clerk

**IN THE DISTRICT COURT OF THE FIFTH JUDICIAL DISTRICT OF THE
STATE OF IDAHO, IN AND FOR THE COUNTY OF TWIN FALLS**

In Re SRBA	)	Subcases 01-1J, <i>et al.</i>
	)	(see list of 51 subcases attached)
Case No. 39576	)	
	)	ORDER DENYING IGWA'S MOTION
	)	FOR RECONSIDERATION

Background

Order Denying Motion to Participate

On August 28, 2007, the Special Master entered an *Order Denying Motion to Participate* denying the Idaho Ground Water Appropriators participation in the above subcases:

IGWA has not asserted ownership of rights to the use of water nor has such ownership been asserted on its behalf – it **represents** water right holders. Hence, IGWA is not and cannot be a party to the adjudication and is not entitled to intervene of right or by permissive intervention in the above subcases.

Motion for Reconsideration

The IGWA filed its *Motion for Reconsideration of Order Denying IGWA's Motion to Participate* on September 6, 2007, because “(a) IGWA was previously served or joined in the SRBA, and (b) IGWA has standing under Idaho law to represent its members who indisputably qualify as a proper party to the adjudication.” It lodged its *Brief in Support* on September 20, 2007, arguing:

Thus, IGWA clearly has standing to participate in the SRBA because it is a private entity that has been joined in the Adjudication on multiple occasions and has been recognized and participated in a multitude of administrative proceedings, SRBA¹ and District Court cases, and the

¹ Subcase 03-10022 (objector) and subcase 92-00021 (objector).

Idaho Supreme Court appeals,² served and joined as a party [footnotes added].

IGWA attached to its *Motion* a copy of its *Amended and Restated Articles of Incorporation* spelling out its primary purpose: “To represent the interests of Idaho’s ground water users and promote the efficient use and economic development of water resources.” It then argued that *Glengary-Gamlin Protective Association, Inc. v. Bonner County Board of Commissioners*, 106 Idaho 84, 87 (Ct. App. 1983), “firmly settled the question of whether an organization has standing to represent its members in Idaho courts.”

The IGWA’s final argument was that “the SRBA District Court should not eliminate associational standing in the SRBA when, as in this case, the protection of common interests among the association’s members practically require collective effort and judicial economy will be served by allowing the organization to represent the collective interests of its members.”

Response to Motion

The “Surface Water Coalition”³ filed its *Response to IGWA’s Motion for Reconsideration of Order Denying IGWA’s Motion to Participate* on November 1, 2007. It argued that “IGWA has failed to make any showing that it has ever been joined in the SRBA, as opposed to merely participating in various distinct subcases in the SRBA without contest from the parties in those subcases.” Further, it argued that despite the *Glengary-Gamlin* test for associational standing, SRBA procedural rules and Idaho statute limit participation in water right proceedings to **claimants and those who have been joined**: “The fact that the claims at issue in these proceedings may impact certain water claimants is of no relevance in light of the plain language of [*SRBA Administrative Order 1, Rules of Procedure*] Rule 10(k) and Idaho Code 42-1401A.”

Finally, the Coalition pointed out that “certain of its [IGWA’s] claimant members are already being represented or are already participating in similar subcases in Basins

² *Nez Perce Tribe v. State of Idaho*, 137 Idaho 654 (2002); *Fish and Wildlife Service v. State of Idaho*, 135 Idaho 655 (2001); and *A&B Irrigation Dist. v. Idaho Conservation League*, 131 Idaho 411 (1998).

³ American Falls Reservoir District #2, A&B Irrigation District, Burley Irrigation District, Milner Irrigation District, Minidoka Irrigation District, North Side Canal Company and Twin Falls Canal Company.

21, 22, and 27.” Besides, “the SRBA Court has already decided that an association does not have standing to participate in a subcase, merely because it represents claimants [citing SRBA Presiding Judge Roger S. Burdick’s July 29, 2002 *Order on Motion to Participate / Intervene*, consolidated subcase no. 75-13316, Wild and Scenic Rivers Claims].”

Hearing

A hearing on IGWA’s *Motion for Reconsideration* was held by telephone on November 8, 2007. Candice M. McHugh appeared for IGWA; Travis L. Thompson and W. Kent Fletcher appeared for various entities collectively called the Surface Water Coalition; R. Lee Leininger appeared for the United States of America, Department of Interior, Bureau of Reclamation and Bureau of Land Management, along with E. Gail McGarry and Fredric W. Price; Gregory W. Moeller appeared for New Lavaside Ditch Company, Ltd., *et al.*; and Garrick L. Baxter appeared for IDWR.

Conclusions

The IGWA has failed to show that the *Order Denying Motion to Participate* is erroneous. The IGWA is not a party to the adjudication or a claimant and hence, may not participate in these subcases. Neither is the IGWA entitled to intervene of right or by permissive intervention because it has not asserted ownership of rights to the use of water nor has such ownership been asserted on its behalf. As noted before, the IGWA merely **represents** water right holders.

The argument that the IGWA “has been joined in the Adjudication on multiple occasions and has been recognized and participated in a multitude of administrative proceedings, SRBA and District Court cases, and the Idaho Supreme Court appeals” is of no consequence. Here, unlike before, the issue of participation is squarely contested and the plain language of *AO-1* and I.C. § 42-1401A limit participation in SRBA subcases to parties to the adjudication and claimants.

Order

THEREFORE, IT IS ORDERED that the IGWA's *Motion for Reconsideration of Order Denying IGWA's Motion to Participate* in subcases 01-1J, *et al.*, is **denied**.

DATED January 3, 2008

A handwritten signature in black ink, reading "Terrence A. Dolan". The signature is written in a cursive style with a horizontal line underneath.

TERRENCE A. DOLAN

Special Master

Snake River Basin Adjudication

EXHIBIT A

Subcase Nos:

01-00001J 01-10477
01-00002A
01-00047E
01-00048
01-00052A
01-00052B
01-00053A
01-00092A
01-00092B
01-00116BB
01-00131A
01-00132A
01-00133A
01-00141
01-00146A
01-00146B
01-00147
01-00148
01-00157A
01-00157B
01-00158B
01-00193A
01-00193B
01-00232
01-00247
01-00259
01-00260
01-00261
01-00263
01-00264
01-00266
01-00298
01-00304
01-00306
01-00324
01-04061
01-10046
01-10048
01-10049
01-10050
01-10057
01-10060
01-10062
01-10091
01-10092
01-10471
01-10472
01-10474
01-10475
01-10476

(Subcase list: MTNPARTCI)
1/03/08

CERTIFICATE OF MAILING

I certify that a true and correct copy of the ORDER DENYING IGWA'S MOTION FOR RECONSIDERATION was mailed on January 03, 2008, with sufficient first-class postage to the following:

MILNER IRRIGATION DISTRICT
NORTH SIDE CANAL COMPANY
TWIN FALLS CANAL COMPANY

Represented by:
BARKER, ROSHOLT & SIMPSON LLP
113 MAIN AVE W, STE 303
PO BOX 485
TWIN FALLS, ID 83303-0485
Phone: 208-733-0700

AMERICAN FALLS RESERVOIR

Represented by:
C THOMAS ARKOOSH
301 MAIN ST
PO BOX 32
GOODING, ID 83330
Phone: 208-934-8872

BLACKFOOT IRRIGATION CO
CORBETT SLOUGH DITCH CO
NEW LAVASIDE DITCH CO LTD
PARSONS DITCH CO
PEOPLES CANAL & IRRIGATION CO
RIVERSIDE CANAL CO
UNITED CANAL CO
WATSON CANAL CO
WEARYRICK DITCH CO

Represented by:
JERRY R. RIGBY
25 N 2ND E
PO BOX 250
REXBURG, ID 83440-0250
Phone: 208-356-3633

IDAHO GROUND WATER

Represented by:
RANDALL C BUDGE
201 E CENTER, STE A2
PO BOX 1391
POCATELLO, ID 83204-1391
Phone: 208-232-6101

A & B IRRIGATION DISTRICT
BURLEY IRRIGATION DISTRICT
FALLS IRRIGATION DISTRICT

Represented by:
ROGER D LING
615 H ST
PO BOX 396
RUPERT, ID 83350-0396
Phone: 208-436-4717

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
USDI BUREAU OF RECLAMATION

Represented by:
US DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE
ENVIRONMENT & NATL' RESOURCES
550 WEST FORT STREET, MSC 033
BOISE, ID 83724

MINIDOKA IRRIGATION DISTRICT

Represented by:
W KENT FLETCHER
1200 OVERLAND AVE
PO BOX 248
BURLEY, ID 83318
Phone: 208-678-3250

RIVERSIDE CANAL CO
PO BOX 52
BLACKFOOT, ID 83221
Phone: 208-785-6633

DIRECTOR OF IDWR
PO BOX 83720
BOISE, ID 83720-0098

PEOPLES CANAL & IRRIGATION CO
1050 W HWY 39
BLACKFOOT, ID 83221
Phone: 208-684-3105

BLACKFOOT IRRIGATION CO
108 E 200 N
BLACKFOOT, ID 83221
Phone: 208-785-6992

(Certificate of mailing continued)

WEARYRICK DITCH CO
42 S 700 W
BLACKFOOT, ID 83221
Phone: 208-684-4747

NEW LAVASIDE DITCH CO LIMITED
66 E RIVER RD
BLACKFOOT, ID 83221
Phone: 208-785-4726

PARSONS DITCH CO
72 S 700 W
BLACKFOOT, ID 83221
Phone: 208-684-4132

THE UNITED CANAL CO
UNITED CANAL CO
74 N 600 W
BLACKFOOT, ID 83221
Phone: 208-785-7027

CORBETT SLOUGH DITCH CO
78 N 100 W
BLACKFOOT, ID 83221
Phone: 208-785-3137

2